

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03870 4987

**FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS**

Volume I

**Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto**

Fall 1994

**These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.**

Page
f
201
132
771
1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 8 1994

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO


FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS

Volume I

Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Fall 1994

These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

TABLE OF CONTENTS*

Volume I

Page

I. INTRODUCTION

Georges Erasmus and Joe Sanders, <i>Canadian History: An Aboriginal Perspective</i> , in <i>Nation to Nation: Aboriginal Sovereignty and the Future of Canada</i> (Englestad & Bird eds. 1992) 3-11	1
Alan D. McMillan, <i>Native Peoples and Cultures of Canada</i> (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1988)	8
Some Facts and Figures	27

II. THE POLITICS OF INDIGENOUS DIFFERENCE

<i>The Justice System and Aboriginal People</i> , in 1 Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of Manitoba (1991) 115-117	33
Fred Plain, <i>A Treatise on the Rights of the Aboriginal Peoples of the Continent of North America</i> , in <i>The Quest for Justice: Aboriginal Peoples and Aboriginal Rights</i> (Boldt & Long eds. 1985), 31-40	35
Russel Lawrence Barsh and James Youngblood Henderson, <i>The Road: Indian Tribes and Political Liberty</i> (1980), 270-79	42
Will Kymlicka, <i>Liberalism, Community and Culture</i> (1991)	44

III. THE CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

<i>R. v. Sparrow</i> , [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1075	49
---	----

IV. ABORIGINAL TITLE

A. The Royal Proclamation

<i>The Royal Proclamation of 1763</i> , R.S.C. 1970, App. II, No. 1	67
---	----

*I am grateful to Peter Miller for his assistance in compiling these materials.

Brian Slattey, *The Hidden Constitution: Aboriginal Rights in Canada* (1984), 32 Amer. J. Comp. Law 361, at 368-72 68

B. The Marshall Trilogy

Johnson v. M'Intosh, 21 U.S. (8 Wheat.) 543 (1823) 73

Cherokee Nation v. Georgia, 30 U.S. (5 Pet.) 1 (1831) ... 77

Worcester v. Georgia, 31 U.S. (6 Pet.) 515 (1832) 81

C. The House of Lords

St. Catherines Milling and Lumber Co. v. The Queen (1888), 14 A.C. 46 (P.C.) 91

In re Southern Rhodesia, [1919] A.C. 211 (P.C.) 97

Amodu Tijani v. The Secretary, Southern Nigeria, [1921] 2 A.C. 399 (P.C.) 104

D. Canadian Principles

Calder v. Attorney General of British Columbia (1973), 34 D.L.R. (3d) 145 (S.C.C.) 113

Hamlet of Baker Lake v. Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, [1980] 1 F.C. 518 (F.C.T.D.) 127

Guerin v. The Queen (1984), 13 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (S.C.C.) 142

E. Recent Developments

Delgamuukw v. British Columbia (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.) 155

Apsassin v. Canada (Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development) (1993), 100 D.L.R. (4th) 504 (F.C.A.) 175

Grand Council of the Crees v. Canada (National Energy Board) (1994), 112 D.L.R. (4th) 129 (S.C.C.) 186

R. v. Jones (1993), 14 O.R. (3d) 421 (Prov. Div) 191

Dean Howard Smith, *The Issue of Compatibility Between Cultural Integrity and Economic Development Among Native American Tribes* (1994), 18 American Indian Culture and Research Journal 177 209

V. THE DISTRIBUTION OF LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Douglas Sanders, *The Constitution, the Provinces, and Aboriginal People*, in *Governments in Conflict: Provinces and Indian Nations in Canada* (Long & Boldt eds., 1988), 151-52 213

A. Federal Jurisdiction

Ontario Mining Co. v. Seybold, [1903] A.C. 73 (P.C.) ... 215

Re Eskimos, [1939] 2 D.L.R. 417 (S.C.C.) 218

Note on *R. v. Derricksan*, 60 D.L.R. (3d) 140 (B.C.C.A.); (1976), 71 D.L.R. (3d) 159 (S.C.C.) 222

B. Provincial Jurisdiction

Cardinal v. A.G. Alberta (1973), 40 D.L.R. (3d) 553 (S.C.C.) 223

Kruger and Manuel v. The Queen (1977), 75 D.L.R. (3d) 434 (S.C.C.) 230

Four B. Manufacturing v. United Garment Workers of America (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 385 (S.C.C.) 235

R. v. Sutherland (1980), 113 D.L.R. (3d) 374 (S.C.C.) .. 242

Dick v. The Queen (1985), 23 D.L.R. (4th) 33 (S.C.C.) .. 244

Jack and Charlie v. The Queen (1985), 21 D.L.R. (4th) 641 (S.C.C.) 252

Delgamuukw v. British Columbia (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.) 259

R. v. Alphonse (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.) 260

VI. TREATIES

A. Introduction

Daniel J. Kuhlen, *A Layperson's Guide to Treaty Rights in Canada* (1985) 263

B. The Classical Approach

R. v. Syliboy, [1929] 1 D.L.R. 307 (N.S. Co. Ct.) 278

C. The Contractual Model

<i>Pawis v. The Queen</i> (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 602 (F.C.T.D.)	285
Indian Chiefs of Alberta, "Citizens Plus," in <i>The Only Good Indian</i> (1983)	290
<i>Johnston v. The Queen</i> (1966), 56 D.L.R. (2d) 749 (Sask. C.A.)	292
<i>R. v. Sikyea</i> (1964), 43 D.L.R. (2d) 150 (N.W.T.C.A.) ...	294
<i>Sikyea v. The Queen</i> , [1964] S.C.R. 642 (S.C.C.)	299
<i>R. v. George</i> (1966), 55 D.L.R. (2d) 386 (S.C.C.)	300

D. Recent Developments

<i>R. v. Taylor and Williams</i> (1981) 34 O.R. (2d) (C.A.) ...	304
<i>Simon v. The Queen</i> (1985), 24 D.L.R. (4th) 390 (S.C.C.)	312
<i>Sannichton Marina Ltd. v. Claxton</i> (1987), 18 B.C.L.R. (2d) 217 (B.C.S.C.)	322
<i>R. v. Sioui</i> , [1990] 70 D.L.R. (4th) 427 (S.C.C.)	327
<i>Horse v. The Queen</i> (1988), 47 D.L.R. (4th) 526 (S.C.C.)	342
<i>Horseman v. The Queen</i> , [1990] 4 W.W.R. 97 (S.C.C.)	348
Bruce W. Hodgins and Jamie Benidickson, <i>The Temagami Experience</i> (1989), 267	361
<i>A.G. Ontario v. Bear Island Foundation</i> (1991), 83 D.L.R. (4th) 381 (S.C.C.)	363
<i>Eastmain Band v. James Bay and Northern Quebec Agreement (Administrator)</i> (1992), 99 D.L.R. (4th) 16 (F.C.A.)	365
<i>Howard v. The Queen</i> , an unreported decision of the Supreme Court of Canada released May 12, 1994	371

Volume II

VII. THE INDIAN ACT

A. General Principles

Claudia Notzke, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Natural Resources in Canada</i> (1994) 173-181	380
Leroy Little Bear, <i>Indian Government Pursuant to the Indian Act</i> , in <i>Pathways to Self-Determination: Canadian Indians and the Canadian State</i> (Little Bear, Boldt & Long eds. 1984)	389
<i>Logan v. Styres</i> (1959), 20 D.L.R. (2d) 416 (Ont. H.C.)..	395
<i>R. v. Gingrich</i> (1958), 29 W.W.R. 471 (Alta. App. Div.)..	399
<i>A.G.B.C. v. Wale</i> (1987), 9 B.C.L.R. (2d) 333 (B.C.C.A.)	402
Frank Cassidy and Robert L. Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 40-50	411

B. "Marrying Out"

<i>Indian Act</i> , R.S.C. 1970, c. I-16	420
<i>Lavell v. A.G. Canada</i> (1973), 38 D.L.R. (3d) 481 (S.C.C.)	422
<i>Lovelace v. Canada</i> , 36 U.N. GOAR Supp. (No. 40) Annex XVIII; U.N. Doc. A/36/40 (1981)	432
<i>Indian Act</i> , R.S.C. 1985, c. I-5	438
Report to Parliament, <i>Implementation of the 1985 Changes to the Indian Act</i> (1987), 8-11	440
<i>Enough is Enough: Aboriginal Women Speak Out</i> (Silman ed. 1987), 215-47	444
Catharine A. MacKinnon, <i>Feminism Unmodified: Discourses on Life and Law</i> (1987), 63-69	460

VIII. ABORIGINAL CHILD WELFARE

A. Introduction

Philip Zylberberg, <i>Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?</i> (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 75-79	465
--	-----

B. "The Best Interests of the Child"

<i>Racine v. Woods</i> (1983), 1 D.L.R. (4th) 193 (S.C.C.)	569
<i>B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services</i> (1988), 51 Man. Rep. (2d) 245 (Man. C.A.)	478
<i>B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 291	483
<i>Tom v. Winnipeg Children's Aid Society</i> (1982), 2 W.W.R. 212 (Man. C.A.)	484

C. Recent Developments

Philip Zylberberg, <i>Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?</i> (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 81-83	486
<i>C.J.K. v. Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto</i> , [1989] 4 C.N.L.R. 75 (Ont. Prov. Ct.)	489
<i>Re Family and Child Service Act of British Columbia</i> , [1990] 4 C.N.L.R. 14 (B.C. Prov. Ct.)	496
<i>Jane Doe v. Awasis Agency of Northern Manitoba</i> (1990), 72 D.L.R. (4th) 738 (Man. Q.B.)	504

IX. RIGHTS OF THE METIS PEOPLE

Catherine Bell, <i>Who Are the Métis People in Section 35(2)?</i> (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 351	507
Paul Chartrand, <i>Aboriginal Rights: The Dispossession of the Métis</i> (1991), 29 Osgoode Hall L.J. 457	516
<i>Dumont v. A.G. Canada</i> (1988), 52 D.L.R. (4th) 25 (Man. C.A.)	528
<i>Dumont v. A. G. Canada</i> (1990), 67 D.L.R. (4th) 159 (S.C.C.)	538
<i>R. v. McPherson</i> , [1992] 4 C.N.L.R. 144 (Man. Prov. Ct.)	539

X. FIRST NATIONS AND THE CHARTER

Mary Ellen Turpel, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and the Canadian Charter: Interpretive Monopolies, Cultural Differences</i> (1989-90), 6 Can. Human Rights Yrbk. 3	551
---	-----

<i>Eastmain Band v. Gilpin</i> , [1988] 3 C.N.L.R. (Que. Prov. Ct.)	556
<i>Manitoba Rice Farmers Association v. Manitoba Human Rights Commission</i> (1987), 50 Man. R. (2d) 92 (Q.B.)	566
<i>R. v. Willcocks</i> (July 7, 1992, Ont. C.J.)	577
<i>Corbiere v. Canada (Minister of Indian and Northern Affairs)</i> (1993), 107 D.L.R. (4th) 582 (F.C.T.D.)	585
<i>Norris v. Thomas</i> , [1992] 2 C.N.L.R. 139 (B.C.S.C.)	599
J. Anthony Long and Katherine Beaty Chiste, <i>Indian Governments and the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i> (1994), 18 American Indian Culture and Research Journal 91	612

XI. ABORIGINAL PEOPLE AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE

<i>R. v. Machekequonabe</i> (1898), 28 O.R. 309 (Div. Ct.)	637
<i>Re Stacey and Montour and the Queen</i> (1981), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 61 (Que. C.A.)	639
Michael Jackson, <i>In Search of the Pathways to Justice: Alternative Dispute Resolution in Aboriginal Communities</i> , [1992] U.B.C. L. Rev. 147, at 148-160	642
<i>R. v. Moses</i> (1992), 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Yukon Terr. Ct.)	655
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Criminal Justice</i> (Report No. 34, 1991), at 13-23	681
Bryan Schwartz, <i>A Separate Aboriginal Justice System?</i> (1990), 28 Man. L.J. 77	688
Jeremy Webber, <i>Individuality, Equality and Difference: Justifications for a Parallel System of Aboriginal Justice</i> (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 133	698
Teressa Nahanee, <i>Dancing With a Gorilla: Aboriginal Women, Justice and the Charter</i> (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 359	705

Volume III

XII. ABORIGINAL GOVERNMENT

A. Introduction

Chief Ovide Mercredi, *First Nations and Self-Determination*, in *Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century* (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 161-66 .. 711

Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, *Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice* (1989), 160-66 716

Roger Gibbons, *Citizenship, Political, and Intergovernmental Problems With Indian Self-Government*, in *Arduous Journey: Canadian Indians and Decolonization* (Ponting ed. 1988), 369-377 720

B. Aboriginal Government and Constitutional Reform

Kathy L. Brock, *The Politics of Aboriginal Self-Government: A Canadian Paradox* (1991), 34 Can. Pub. Admin. 272 727

J. Edward Chamberlin, *Aboriginal Rights and the Meech Lake Accord*, in *Competing Constitutional Visions: The Meech Lake Accord* (Swinton & Rogerson eds., 1988), 11-19 736

Re Native Women's Association of Canada and The Queen (1992), 95 D.L.R. (4th) 106 (Fed. C.A.) 743

Draft Legal Text of the Charlottetown Accord (October 9, 1992) 752

Globe and Mail, July 27, 1993, A2 759

Globe and Mail, July 28, 1993, A21 760

Globe and Mail, July 28, 1993, A20 761

C. Aboriginal Government and the Courts

Michael Asch and Patrick Macklem, *Aboriginal Rights and Canadian Sovereignty: An Essay on R. v. Sparrow* (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 498 762

Hamar Foster, *Forgotten Arguments: Aboriginal Title and Sovereignty in Canada Jurisdiction Act Cases* (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 343 766

Brian Slattery, *First Nations and the Constitution: A*

<i>Question of Trust</i> (1992), 71 Can. Bar Rev. 261	775
Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, <i>Partners in Confederation: Aboriginal Peoples, Self-Government, and the Constitution</i> (1993)	783
<i>Casimel v. I.C.B.C.</i> (1993), 106 D.L.R. (4th) 720 (B.C.C.A.)	798
Kent Roach, <i>Remedies for Violations of Aboriginal Rights</i> (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 498	807

D. Aboriginal Government and the Land Claims Process

Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 135-55	818
Task Force to Review Comprehensive Claims Policy, <i>Living Treaties: Lasting Agreements</i> (Ottawa: Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, 1985)	832
Ministry of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, <i>Comprehensive Land Claims Policy</i> (1987)	841
Donald Purich, <i>The Inuit and Their Land</i> (1992)	855
Report of the British Columbia Claims Task Force (1991), 16-71	864

E. Aboriginal Government and Institutional Design

David C. Hawkes and Allan M. Maslove, <i>Fiscal Arrangements for Aboriginal Self-Government</i> , in <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Government Responsibilities: Exploring Federal and Provincial Roles</i> (Hawkes & Maslove eds., 1989), 103-106	916
Noel Lyon, <i>Aboriginal Self-Government: Rights to Citizenship and Access to Governmental Services</i> (1984), at 48-69	919
C.E.S. Franks, <i>Public Administration Questions Relating to Aboriginal Self-Government</i> (1987)	940
John Weinstein, <i>Aboriginal Self-Determination Off a Land Base</i> (1986)	952

XIII. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN THE UNITED STATES

A. General Principles

Robert N. Clinton, Nell Jessup Newton and Monroe E. Price, <i>American Indian Law</i> (3d ed. 1991), 137-164	960
<i>Ex Parte Crow Dog</i> , 109 U.S. 556 (1883).....	980
Sidney L. Haring, <i>Crow Dog's Case: American Indian Sovereignty, Tribal Law, and United States Law in the Nineteenth Century</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 101-130.....	983
<i>United States v. Kagama</i> , 118 U.S. 375 (1886)	989
<i>Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock</i> , 187 U.S. 554 (1903)	992
<i>Tee-Hit-Ton Indians v. United States</i> , 348 U.S. 272 (1954)	995
<i>Morton v. Mancari</i> , 417 U.S. 535 (1974)	1000
<i>Lyng v. Northwest Cemetery Protective Association</i> , 485 U.S. 439 (1988)	1007

B. Tribal Government

<i>Talton v. Mayes</i> , 163 U.S. 376 (1896)	1023
<i>Oliphant v. Suquamish Indian Tribe</i> , 435 U.S. 191 (1978)	1027
<i>Duro v. Reina</i> , 110 Sup. Ct. 2053 (1990)	1033
Frank Pommersheim, <i>The Contextual Legitimacy of Adjudication in Tribal Courts and the Role of the Tribal Bar as an Interpretive Community: An Essay</i> , 18 New Mex. L. Rev. 49 (1988)	1038

XIV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND

Garth Nettheim, <i>Australian Aborigines and the Law</i> (1987), 2 Law & Anthropology 371-84, 399-400	1050
<i>Mabo v. Queensland</i> , [1992] 5 C.N.L.R. 1 (Aust. H.C.) ..	1057
Aboriginal Provisional Government, <i>The Australian Constitution: An Aid to Justice or an Accomplice to Oppression</i> (June 4, 1993)	1072

<i>The Treaty of Waitangi</i> , 1975 New Zealand Statutes 114, Sch. 1	1094
E. Taihakurie Durie, <i>The New Zealand Maorie and the Waitangi Tribunal</i> , in <i>Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century</i> (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 149-59 .	1096

XV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

Robert Laurence, <i>Learning to Live With the Plenary Power of Congress Over the Indian People: An Essay in Reaction to Professor Williams' Algebra</i> , 30 Ariz. L. Rev. 413 (1988), at 428-30	1104
Robert A. Williams, Jr., <i>Learning to Live With Eurocentric Myopia: A Reply to Professor Laurence's Learning to Live With the Plenary Power of Congress Over the Indian Nations</i> , 30 Ariz. L. Rev. 439 (1988), at 454- 55	1106
<i>Ominayak v. Canada</i> , U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/38/D/167/1984 (Human Rights Committee decision released March 28, 1990)	1107
<i>Grand Chief Donald Marshall and the Mikmaq Tribal Society v. Canada</i> , U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/43/D/205/1986 (Human Rights Committee decision released July 25, 1990)	1114
<i>R.L. et al. v. Canada</i> , U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/43/D/358/1989 (Human Rights Committee decision released April 1, 1991	1119
<i>Draft Universal Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples</i>	1128
S. James Anaya, <i>The Capacity of International Law to Advance Ethnic or Nationality Claims</i> , 75 Iowa L. Rev. 837 (1990)	1132

